Validation rules

When reviews are validated in Archie, the majority of the rules applied are the same as used in RevMan. In addition to using all the validation rules from RevMan, Archie applies a few extra rules that rely on information that is not available to RevMan. Some of the extra rules in Archie apply for all validation checks (e.g. in the Validation Report), while others are only relevant when reviews are marked for publication.

Validation rules can result in an error messages or a warning. If a review has Errors, it cannot be published in its present form. Warnings are non-critical but serve as guidelines for complying with the correct format of Cochrane reviews.

Standard Archie validation rules

Section	Rule	Stage	Message	Warning or Error
Topics	Reviews should be linked to one or more topics.	P + R	Review is not linked to any topics.	Warning
	A cited Cochrane review's DOI value should match with a valid Cochrane review.	P + R	CD number in the citation ([CDnumber]]) is not linked to any Cochrane review in Archie.	Warning
	A cited Cochrane review's title should match with the actual published version.	P + R	Review title in the citation ([title]) for the Cochrane review [CDnumber] is different from the title of the review version in Archie ([title]).	Warning
	A cited Cochrane review's DOI Pub value cannot be greater than the review update no.	P + R	Incorrect pub number.	Warning
	A published version should exist for the given issue and year of a cited Cochrane review.	P + R	No published version of the cited Cochrane review ([CDnumber]) is found for the given issue ([issue]) and year ([year])	Warning
	A cited Cochrane review should be in the same stage (Protocol or Review) as the actual published version.	P + R	The cited Cochrane review ([CDnumber]) is not a [stage] version.	Warning

Check-in warnings and messages

Warning messages relating to **Review properties** are:

Rule	Message	Warning or Error
The Review ID and the title of the file checked in should match an existing record in Archie.	Review not found. New review created in [Group]	Warning
The unique ID for the review should match an ID in Archie.	The unique ID for this review ([Review ID]) did not match an ID in the system, but a match by title was found. The ID of the new version has been changed to match the ID in the system ([Review ID]).	Warning
The Stage of the review can be updated in Archie from Registered Title to Protocol, or from Protocol to Full Review, as a result of a draft being submitted for editorial approval.	The stage has been updated to [New stage].	-
A review published (or marked for publication) as a Protocol or Full Review, it cannot be set back to the previous stage (Registered Title or Protocol, respectively).	Review stage cannot be set back from [Existing stage] to [New stage]	Warning

Warning messages relating to **Document Roles** are:

Description	Message	Warning or Error
A person should have a record in Archie.	[Name]: No matching person found ([Message])	Warning
A new Document Role can be created in Archie as a result of changes made to the Contact Person and/or list of Authors in RevMan. **Note:** Requires follow-up if you did not intend to create a new Document Role.	[Name]: [Role name] document role created.	-
Shown for authors whose order in the list of authors in the RevMan file has changed.	[Name]: [Role name] document role updated.	

A person with relevant permissions can create and edit Document Roles. See Permissions linked to Review Group roles. **Note**: Archie will accept the review, but not modify the Document Roles.	[Name]: Failed to create [Role name] role (permission not granted).	Warning
A person should have the required permissions to reorder the list of authors. **Note:** Archie will accept the review, but not modify the Document Roles.	[Name]: Failed to update [Role name] role ([Message]).	Warning
A Document Role can be deleted in Archie as a result of changes made to the Contact Person and/or list of Authors in RevMan. **Note**: Requires follow-up if you did not intend to delete the Document Role.	[Name]: [Role name] document role deleted.	-
A person should have the required permissions to delete a Document Role. **Note**: Archie will accept the review, but not modify the Document Roles.	[Name]: Failed to delete [Role name] role (permission not granted).	Warning

Note: *Document and Group Roles are correlated in the sense that if someone with the necessary permissions adds a Document Role (either in Archie or in RevMan) for a person who does not already have the corresponding Group Role, the system will recognize this and automatically add the appropriate Group Role to the person's record in Archie. However, there is no such automatic linkage when Document Roles are deleted. In such cases, you may need to follow up to check whether the corresponding Group Role should also be deleted.*

To validate an individual review from within Archie

1. Find the review you want to validate.
2. Right-click the review and choose Reports > Validate. Any Errors and Warnings identified will be displayed in the report viewer.

See also Review Reports

RevMan validation rules

The majority of the validation rules used in Archie correspond to those used in RevMan.

Validation rules are divided into two types: those that result in error messages and those that result in warnings. Errors must be corrected to ensure that a review is published in its present form. Warnings are non-critical but serve as guidelines for complying with the correct format of Cochrane reviews. Some rules apply to protocols only (P), some apply to reviews only (R), and some apply to both reviews and protocols (P+R).

The context in which you run the validation affects what information may be available. There are four cumulative sets of validation checks:

1. In **RevMan as you type** - everything that can be checked immediately without contacting Archie.
2. In the **RevMan validation report** - also includes contacting Archie to check references to reviews.
3. In the **Archie Validation report** - also includes a check for Topics links.
4. In the **Archie Publication Wizard validation report** - also includes checks for publication status and history.

Checks in RevMan as you type

Also in RevMan validation report, Archie Validation report, and Archie Publication Wizard validation report.

Section or Field	Rule	Stage	Message	Warning or Error
Title	Cannot be empty.	P + R	Section is empty.	Error
Title	Cannot exceed 256 characters		Title is longer than 256 characters.	Error
Authors	Cannot be empty.	P + R	Section is empty.	Error
Author (person)	First Name and Family Name cannot both be empty.	P + R	First Name and Last Name are empty.	Error
Author (group)	Group Name cannot be empty.	P + R	Group Name is empty	Error
Author	Record must be linked to Archie.	P + R	Record is not linked to Archie.	Error
Author (person)	City cannot be empty for any of the addresses.	P + R	City is empty.	Error

Author (person)	Country cannot be empty for any of the addresses.	P + R	Country is empty.	Error
Author (person)	First Name or Family Name should not be empty.	P + R	First Name or Family Name is empty.	Warning
Author (person)	Organisation should not be empty for any of the addresses.	P + R	Organisation is empty.	Warning
Contact person	First Name and Family Name cannot both be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	First Name and Family Name are empty.	Error
Contact person	Department, Organisation, Address 1 and Address 2 cannot all be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	Department, Organisation, Address 1 and Address 2 are empty.	Error
Contact person	City cannot be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	City is empty.	Error
Contact person	Country cannot be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	Country is empty.	Error
Contact person	Email cannot be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	E-mail is empty.	Error
Contact person	First Name or Family Name should not be empty of the Primary Address.	P + R	First Name or Family Name is empty.	Warning
Dates	Assessed as Up-to-date cannot be empty.	R	Assessed as Up-to-date is empty.	Error
Dates	Date of Search cannot be empty.	R	Date of Search is empty.	Error
Dates	Assessed as Up-to-date cannot be in the future.	R	Assessed as Up-to-date is in the future.	Error
Dates	Date of Search cannot be in the future.	R	Date of Search is in the future.	Error
Dates	Assessed as Up-to-date should not be more than six months after Date of Search.	R	Assessed as Up-to-date is more that six months after Date of Search.	Warning
Dates	Next Stage Expected should not be empty.	P	Next Stage Expected is empty.	Warning
Dates	Next Stage Expected should not be in the past.	P + R	Next Stage Expected is in the past.	Warning
Dates	Protocol First Published should not be empty for a published review.	R (published)	Protocol First Published is empty.	Warning
What's new	Section cannot be empty unless protocol or review is new.	P + R (not new)	What's new is empty.	Error
What's new	Only one declaration event is allowed.	P + R	More than one declaration event ('New citation' or 'No longer being updated').	Error
What's new	If an Updated event is present, the Date of search should be less than two years old.	R	Review is declared to be updated, but Date of search is more than two years ago.	Warning
What's new	If a New citation: conclusions not changed event is present, there should usually also be an Updated event.	R	A new citation is declared without the review being updated. This should only be used in rare circumstances if a serious error in the citation record needs to be corrected.	Warning
What's new	If a Feedback incorporated event is present, there should be feedback in the review.	P + R	A 'Feedback incorporated' event is included, but the Feedback section is empty.	Warning
Event	Only events relevant to the current stage are allowed.	P + R	Event is not allowed at [Protocol/Full review] stage.	Error
Event	Date cannot be empty.	P + R	Date is empty.	Error
Event	Description cannot be empty.	P + R	Description is empty.	Error
Event	Dates cannot be in the future	P + R	Date is in the future.	Warning
Event	Withdrawn reviews only support Amended events.	R	Withdrawn reviews only support Amended events.	Error
Abstract	Abstract should not exceed 700 words.	R	Section is longer than 700 words (word count [n]).	Warning
Abstract	Abstract cannot exceed 1000 words.	R	Section is longer than 1000 words (word count [n]).	Error
Plain language summary	Summary should not exceed 400 words.	R	Section is longer than 400 words (word count [n]).	Warning
Plain language summary	Summary cannot exceed 700 words.	R	Section is longer than 700 words (word count [n]).	Error

Summary title (not DTA)	Default text '[Summary title]' should be modified.	R	Section is empty.	Error
Summary text (not DTA)	Default text '[Summary text]' should be modified.	R	Section is empty.	Error
Summary title (DTA only)	Default text '[Summary title]' should be modified.	R	Section is empty.	Warning
Summary title (DTA only)	Default text '[Summary text]' should be modified.	R	Section is empty.	Warning
Main text sections	Mandatory text sections (depending on stage) and activated text sections (under mandatory parent sections) cannot be empty. Most main text sections are mandatory with three exceptions (see below).	P + R	Section is empty.	Error
Acknowledgements, Contributions of authors	Sections should usually not be empty.	P + R	Section is empty.	Warning
Published notes	Cannot be empty for withdrawn reviews.	P + R	For a withdrawn review, this section should contain the reason for withdrawal.	Error
Study characteristics	All fields should not be empty at the same time.	R	Section is empty.	Warning
Summary of findings tables, Summary of results tables (DTA)	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Summary of results tables (DTA)	Cannot be empty.	R	Section is empty.	Error
Summary of findings table, Summary of results table (DTA)	Title cannot be empty.	R	Title is empty.	Error
Additional tables	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	P + R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Additional table	Title cannot be empty.	P + R	Title is empty.	Error
Additional table	Table should be linked from the text.	P + R	Table is not linked from the text.	Error
Additional table	Links to tables should follow a sequential order.	P + R	The order in which Tables are linked is not correct. Links to Table [n] must come after links to Table [m].	Warning
Additional table	Number of columns should not exceed 10 columns	P + R	Table contains more than 10 columns.	Warning
Additional table	Number of columns cannot exceed 25 columns.	P + R	Table contains more than 25 columns.	Error
Included study, Excluded study	Study should have at least one reference.	R	No reference found.	Warning
Reference	All fields should not be empty at the same time.	P + R	Reference is empty.	Warning
Reference	Required fields should not be empty.	P + R	[Field name] is empty.	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	SO field should be 'Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews'.	P + R	Journal/Book/Source should be Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews.	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	Should have DOI identifier.	P + R	DOI is missing.	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	The DOI identifier should be specified correct.	P + R	Multiple error messages depending on what is wrong.	Warning
Additional references	References cannot be reused		[identifier] is already used as an id in included or excluded studies.	Warning
Additional reference	Reference should be linked from the text.	P + R	Reference is not linked from the text.	Warning
Data and analyses	Numbering sequence of comparisons should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Comparison	Name cannot be empty.	R	Name is empty.	Error

Comparison	Numbering sequence of outcomes should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Comparison	Should not have empty outcomes.	R	One or more outcomes have no associated study data.	Warning
Outcome	Name cannot be empty.	R	Name is empty.	Error
Outcome	Numbering sequence of subgroups should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Outcome	An active choice af labels for graph axes is required.	R	The default graph label (Favours [experimental]/Favours [control]) for forest plots must be changed.	Error
Numeric outcome	I^2 test should be < 95% if totals are calculated.	R	An I^2 of [value] represents highly inconsistent findings across studies, and may indicate an error in the data.	Warning
Other outcome	No column heading should be empty.	R	One of the column headings is empty.	Warning
Subgroup	Name cannot be empty.	R	Name is empty.	Error
Numeric subgroup	Cannot be excluded from analysis.	R	Subgroup not included in analysis.	Error
Numeric subgroup	I^2 test should be < 95% if subtotals are calculated.	R	An I^2 of [value] represents highly inconsistent findings across studies, and may indicate an error in the data.	Warning
Numeric study data	Cannot be excluded from analysis.	R	Study data not included in analysis.	Error
Inverse variance outcome or subgroup	Option to enter number of participants has been selected, but no data have been entered for any studies.	R	The option to enter number of participants has been selected, but no data have been entered.	Warning
Dichotomous study data	Events <= Total and Total > 0.	R	Study data are invalid.	Error
Continuous study data	SD >= 0 and Total > 0.	R	Study data are invalid.	Error
Inverse variance study data	SE >= 0.	R	Study data are invalid.	Error
O-E and variance study data	V >= 0.	R	Study data are invalid.	Error
Tests (DTA)	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Analyses (DTA)	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Figures	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	P + R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Figures	The recommended Number of figures has been exceeded		The recommended maximum number of figures (6) has been exceeded - please remove [n].	Warning
Figure	Figure should be linked from the text.	P + R	Figure is not linked from the text.	Error
Figure	Generic figures, flow diagrams orRisk of Bias/Quality table plots should be smaller than 1000 x 2000 pixels.	P + R	Image is [x] pixels wide and [y] pixels high. Size is too big to fit on some screens or printers.	Warning
Figure	Links to figures should follow a sequential order.	P + R	The order in which Figures are linked is not correct. Links to Figure [n] must come after links to Figure [m].	Warning
Sources of support	Section should not be empty.	P + R	No sources of support found.	Warning
Source of support	Name cannot be empty.	P + R	Name is empty.	Error
Feedback	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	P + R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Feedback item	Title cannot be empty.	P + R	Title is empty.	Error
Feedback item	Links to feedback items should follow a sequential order.	P + R	The order in which Feedback are linked is not correct. Links to Feedback item [n] must come after links to Feedback item [m].	Warning
Feedback text section	Section should not be empty.	P + R	Section is empty.	Warning
Appendices	Numbering sequence should be unbroken.	P + R	There is a gap in the numbering sequence - use Renumber.	Warning
Appendix	Title cannot be empty.	P + R	Title is empty.	Error

Appendix	Section should not be empty.	P + R	Section is empty.	Warning.
Appendix	Links to appendices should follow a sequential order.	P + R	The order in which Appendices are linked is not correct. Links to Appendix [n] must come after links to Appendix [m].	Warning

Checks in RevMan validation report

From version 5.2 and newer. Also in Archie validation report and Archie Publication Wizard validation report.

Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	A cited Cochrane review's DOI value should match with a valid Cochrane review.	P + R	CD number in the citation ([CDnumber]]) is not linked to any Cochrane review in Archie.	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	A cited Cochrane review's title should match with the actual published version.	P + R	Review title in the citation ([title]) for the Cochrane review [CDnumber] is different from the title of the review version in Archie ([title]).	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	A cited Cochrane review's DOI Pub value cannot be greater than the review update no.	P + R	Incorrect pub number.	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	A published version should exist for the given issue and year ofa cited Cochrane review.	P + R	No published version of the cited Cochrane review ([CDnumber]) is found for the given issue ([issue]) and year ([year])	Warning
Cochrane review reference, Cochrane protocol reference	A cited Cochrane review should be in the same stage (Protocol or Review) as the actual published version.	P + R	The cited Cochrane review ([CDnumber]) is not a [stage] version.	Warning

Checks in Archie validation report

Also in Archie Publication Wizard validation report.

Topics	Reviews should be linked to one or more topics.	P + R	Review is not linked to any topics.	Warning

Checks in Archie publication wizard

Section or Field	Rule	Stage	Message	Warning or Error
Status	A New review cannot have status Withdrawn.	P + R	A new [protocol/full review] cannot be withdrawn.	Error
Events	A reinstated review (where previously published version was withdrawn) that is not substantively updated.	P + R	A reinstated (previously withdrawn) [protocol/full review] must have a new citation and a [Major change/ Conclusions changed] event.	Error
History	A protocol should be published before review is published.	R	There is not record of a published protocol for this full review.	Warning
Title	Published reviews should have a unique title.	P + R	There is another published [protocol/full review] with the same title in the [name of CRG]	Warning
	A previously deleted review cannot be published again.	R	Only protocols can be resurrected, and they must return as active with a new citation and a Major change event.	Error
	The address for an Author or Contact person should not both be marked as hidden and published in a review.	P + R	The [label] address for [name] is marked as hidden, but the [contact details are/affiliation is] published with this review. This conflict should be resolved.	Warning
	The stage cannot be set back.	R	The stage cannot be set back from [stage] to [stage].	Error
	All updates should have a new citation.	R	All updates should have a new citation.	Warning

	A review cannot be published with both a 'No longer being updated' and an 'Updated' event in What's new table.	R	A stable (no longer updated) review cannot have an Updated event under What's New.	Error