Cochrane policy on rejecting Cochrane Reviews.

Decision process

Two CRG Editors (including the Co-ordinating Editor or delegate) must agree the decision to reject the Cochrane Review.

The Managing Editor (ME), or their delegate, must notify the author team (including all co-authors) of the Editors’ decision to reject the Cochrane Review. The correspondence should include the detailed reasons for the decision, including a written report for Cochrane Reviews and updates of Cochrane Reviews, and a link to Cochrane’s policy on rejecting Cochrane Reviews.

Notify Editor in Chief

When the CRG rejects a draft Cochrane Review before publication, the ME, or their delegate, must forward the decision email to the Editor in Chief (emd@cochrane.org), with the subject line “Rejection of a Cochrane Review” providing the review title, CD number, authors and review stage (protocol/review), if not included in the original email.

Recording the decision in Archie

The editorial decisions that led to the rejection of the review proposal, protocol or review must be recorded in the Notes tab of the review proposal/protocol’s Properties sheet. Notes should be as factual as possible, recording what has occurred and the actions taken (if appropriate), as opposed to judgmental. Information on different types of ‘notes’ in Archie, including who can see your notes, is available here.

If the review proposal/protocol/review was rejected for reasons specific to the Author team, then a factual Note should also be added to the Properties sheet of the relevant person records in Archie.

Step-by-step instructions also available on the Archie Knowledge Base here.

For a review proposal

- On the General tab, check the Write Phase is in Editorial.
- On the Advanced tab, change the Status to Inactive. This will deregister the title.
- Abort the Workflow.
- Create a new Note in the Properties sheet of the review proposal. On the Note tab select Note Type: Editorial Management. In the Title field enter “Rejected”. In the text box on the Note tab, record the reason(s) that led to the rejection of the review proposal. This should be a concise, factual description of what preceeded the decision to reject. On the Sharing tab select ‘Administrative note for’. Administrative notes can be read by users with permission to read administrative notes for the chosen group, including Super Users and System Administrators.
- Move the rejected review proposal to the Inactive section of the Vacant titles folder in Archie (or follow your usual CRG’s procedure for filing the rejected review proposal).

For an unpublished protocol

- On the General tab, change the Write Phase to Editorial. Change the Stage to Vacant Title.
- On the Advanced tab, change the Status to Inactive.
- Abort the Workflow.
- Create a new Note in the Properties sheet of the protocol. On the Note tab select Note Type: Editorial Management. In the Title field enter “Rejected”. In the text box on the Note type, record the reason(s) that led to the rejection of the protocol. This should be a concise, factual description of what preceeded the decision to reject. On the Sharing tab select ‘Administrative note for’. Administrative notes can be read by users with permission to read administrative notes for the chosen group, including Super Users and System Administrators.
- Move the rejected protocol to the Inactive section of the Vacant titles folder in Archie (or follow your usual CRG’s procedure for filing the rejected protocol).
- Consider de-registering the title.
For an unpublished Cochrane Review or an unpublished update of a Cochrane Review

- On the General tab, change the Write Phase to Editorial.
- On the Advanced tab, change the Status to Withdrawn.
- Abort the Workflow.
- Create a new Note in the Properties sheet of the review. On the Note tab select Note Type: Editorial Management. In the Title field enter 'Rejected'. In the text box on the Note type, record the reason(s) that led to the rejection of the review. This should be a concise, factual description of what preceded the decision to reject. On the Sharing tab select 'Administrative note for'. Administrative notes can be read by users with permission to read administrative notes for the chosen group, including Super Users and System Administrators.
- If the Protocol of the rejected draft Review is to be withdrawn (refer to the policy for withdrawing Cochrane Reviews), change the Stage back to Protocol and the Status of the rejected draft Review to Withdrawn. The rejected draft Review will be moved automatically to the Withdrawn section of the Protocols folder in Archie.
- Consider making the unpublished Cochrane Review/update of a Cochrane Review available to a new author team.